

Digital Receipt

This receipt acknowledges that Turnitin received your paper. Below you will find the receipt information regarding your submission.

The first page of your submissions is displayed below.

Submission author: Ot Ena

Periksa similarity Assignment title:

Submission title: Religion Representation in Indonesian e-Textbooks- A Visual ...

ntation_in_Indonesian_e-Textbooks-_A_Visual_Content_Analy... File name:

675.24K File size:

Page count: 8

Word count: 4,011

Character count: 22,710

Submission date: 12-May-2022 02:28PM (UTC+0700)

Submission ID: 1834472571

Religion Representation in Indonesian e-Textbooks: A Visual Content Analysis

Ouda Teda EnaEnglish Language Education Study Program, Sanata Dharma University

Abstract
The purpose of the study was to reviewed the visual images used as illustrations in the English electronic textbooks for grades ten, eleven, and twelve in indonesia. Quillattiev visual content analysis was employed as the methodology of the research. The analysis focused on whether these e-textbooks canomicated the religious diversity of the students. Cultural diversity that influenced students learning in indonesian contexts was crucial to examine because the students were book ground of Indonesian. The text was considered to the content of the

Religion Representation in Indonesian e-Textbooks- A Visual Content Analysis

by Ena Ot

Submission date: 12-May-2022 02:28PM (UTC+0700)

Submission ID: 1834472571

File name: ntation_in_Indonesian_e-Textbooks-_A_Visual_Content_Analysis.pdf (675.24K)

Word count: 4011

Character count: 22710

Religion Representation in Indonesian e-Textbooks: A Visual Content Analysis

14 da Teda Ena

English Language Education Study Program, Sanata Dharma University

Abstract

The purpose of the study was to evaluate the visual images used as illustrations in the English electronic textbooks for grades ten, eleven, and twelve in Indonesia. Qualitative visual content analysis was employed as the methodology of the research. The analysis focused on whether these e-textbooks accommodated the religious diversity of the students. Cultural diversity that influenced students learning in Indonesian contexts was crucial to examine because the students were so diverse as a result of the ge8raphical conditions and historical background of Indonesia. Religious identity is a dimension of self, as an individual and as a group member. It forms, develops, and emerges from membership in a particular religious group. The documents analyzed in this study were the visual images found in the English e-textbooks designed for 10th, 11th, and 12th graders in Ind 18esia. The document analysis procedure included document selections, protocol development, data collection, data coding and organization, and data analysis. Corresponding to the research question, the visual images were analyzed to determine whether they represented religious diversity of the students impartially. Eight English e-textbooks were examined. The result showed that certain religions were under represented in all English e-textbooks examined. Due to the fact that the some religious groups were significantly less represented in numbers, they were also considerably underrepresented in roles. The range of roles of the underrepresented religions depicted in the English e-textbooks were very limited.

Diversity of Indonesia

Indonesia is a large country covering an area of 5,193,250 square kilometers, out of which 2,027,087 square kilometers are 6 land and the remainder is water. The Indonesian population is estimated to be 220,953,634 people. It is fourth in the world for its population density. According to the data from the Central Bureau of Statistics the number of school children is 25,389,000 (*Biro Pusat Statistik* or The Central Bureau of Statistics, 2010). These school children represent the diversity of the Indonesian population. The most notable diversity in Indonesia includes ethnicity, religion, gender, and social economic status.

Geographically, Indonesia consists of more than 15,000 Islands. Administratively, it is divided into 33 prov 12 es (See Figure 1.1). The population of Indonesia is 220,953,634 people from more than 1000 ethnic groups with more than 700 different languages (Davies, 2010; Parker, 2010; Suryadinata, Arifin, & Ananta, 2017 In terms of religious diversity, the Indonesian government officially acknowledges six religions, namely Islam, Protestantism, Catholicism, Hinduism, Buddhism, and Confucianism. Indonesia with a population of 220 million Muslims has become the nation with the

largest Muslim population in the world. Each of the four aspects of cultural diversity will be discussed in the next sections.

Religion in a broad sense refers to any pattern of beliefs, emotions, practices, and organization that derive from perceptions of the ultimate sufficance of the human and natural worlds (Beckford, 2010). In Indonesia everyone has the right to follow a religion of his or her choice but the government only recognizes six religious in stample, Islam, Buddhism, Hinduism, Catholicism, Protestantism, and Confucianism. Islam is the dominant religion in 20 donesia with 88% (around 220 million) of the population being Muslim. To smakes Indonesia the largest Muslim country in the world. Other religions include Protestantism (6%), Roman Catholicism (3%), Hinduism (2%), Buddhism (1%), and other smaller religions. In general Muslims fall into two categories, Javanese traditionalists who often align with Nahdatul Ulama (Charismatic Islamic Scholars) and modernist Muslims who align themselves with Muhammadiyah, a mass-Muslim organization with a more religiously orthodox but progressive social outlook.

Constitutionally Indonesia is a secular state but religion, in this case Islam, exists in most affairs (World Trade Press, 2010). Some Islamic groups have been trying to establish an Islamic state that adopts Sharia law in Indonesia. Aceh, the western most province, has adopted Sharia law completely. However, most Muslims in Indonesia strive for a moderate Islam that has a strong commitment to tolerance and pluralism (Hefner in van Wichelen, 2010). Although ultraconservative or more hard-line tendencies exist within Islamism in Indonesia, moderation is the norm and demonstrates how Islam and democracy are compatible (van Wichelen, 2010). Aligning Islamic traditions with globalization forces of consumerism played a central role in shaping middle class Muslims, for example, by turning the modes of veiling into commodifiable accessories of identity and/or lifestyle (van Wichelen, 2010).

Religion plays a significant role in Indonesian society. The Indonesian constitution mandates that all persons have to be religious. People have to choose one of the six religions acknowledged by the government. This religion is included on national identity cards and other formal documents. In reality there are many people who practice traditional belief systems such as animism although they are officially registered as members of certain religious groups (Parker, 2010).

Conflicts and tensions between Christians and Muslims exist in areas where the number of the populations is almost the same. In areas where one religious group is a minority one-way conflicts occur. Radical Muslim clerics and aggressive Christian missionaries contribute significantly to these conflicts even inciting them in some cases. Some politicians take advantage of these situations to gain power. (Haryatmoko, 2010; Warta, 2011).

Religious education is a compulsory subject at all education levels from elementary school to university. According to the 2003 law of National Education System schools and universities should provide teachers of each religion for the students. This policy is challenging for religious-based schools. Public schools often segregate students with different religions to make scheduling easier. This approach has been criticized as creating tensions among students with different religions rather than promoting interreligious understanding (Kelabora, 1979; Zuhdi, 2005; Soejadmoko, 2009; Haryatmoko, 2010).

Similar to ethnicity, religion diversity in the classrooms reflects the diversity in the society. In some areas public schools might consist only of students from one religious group but in some others they might consist of students from many different religions. Religions and religious education as a compulsory school subject play important roles in shaping the students' views about inter-religious relationships in the society.

Textbook Evaluation

21

Materials evaluation is an attempt to measure the value of materials (Tomlinson, 1998). It can predict whether the materials will promote and facilitate the learning process of the stude10. Learning materials are relevant to and useful for the students when they are of leathers' interests and related to tasks which learners need to perform in real life. Including cultural aspects and local contexts with balanced representation will increase students' motivation which in turns will help them to engage with the learning materials that might increase to learners' chance to succeed in learning. Studying English teaching materials through visual content analysis is important in an Indonesian context because it could contribute to the development of better learning materials that are designed to 22 ter to a very diverse population.

This study is crucial because Indonesia is a very diverse nation in terms of religion, ethnicity, and socioeconomic status (Suryadinata et al., 2005). It is even more crucial because the e-textbooks are intended for all students around the country. Textbooks play an important role in the Indonesian education system. School teachers rely on textbooks as the predominant sour of information for teachers and students. There has been no systematic study of e-textbooks used in Indonesian high schools in terms of their gender, socio-economic, religious and ethnic representation. Through the use of visual content analysis, the researcher will attempt to determine whether, and to that extent, gender, socio-economic, religious and ethnic diversity are represented in English e-textbooks for high school.

This study is expected to encourage English textbook writers and publishers to deal with more balance? representations of gender, ethnicity, religion, and socioeconomic status and improve English language teaching (ELT) 13 Indonesia by including local contexts and thereby decreasing the domination of English speaking countries such as, the United States, United Kingdom, and Australia which are often refeated to as the center circle countries in ELT (Kachru, 1996).

Learning materials play an important role in teaching and learning activities in the classrooms. Textbooks are often the only if not the main sources of learning Indonesia. Indonesia with a population of more than 200 million is a diverse country in terms of ethnicity, language, religion, and socio-economic status (SES). Publishing any learning materials for schools should take diversity into account in order that the materials cater to the learning needs of students with different ethnic, language, religion, and socio-economic backgrounds.

In order to promote learning, materials should be culturally relevant and inclusive, accommodating the many cultural differences of the students. Culturally relevant teaching materials should include students' culture in order to maintain it and to avoid misinterpretations other cultures (Ladson-Billing, 2009). Culturally relevant teaching is a pedagogy that empowers students intellectually, socially, emotionally, and politically by using cultural referents to impart knowledge, skills, and attitudes. These cultural referents are not merely vehicles for bridging or explaining the dominant culture; they are aspects of the curriculum on their own right (Ladson-Billing, 2009a, p. 20).

Tomlinson and Lynch-Brown (2010) recommended criteria for evaluating and selecting culturally relest nt learning materials for school and classroom libraries. These criteria include authentic depiction of the cultural experience from the perspective of that group; accuracy of cultural details in text and illustrations; positive images of minority characters; balance between historic and contemporary views of groups; and adequate representation of any group. Similarly, Campbell (2010) put forward fifteen minimum qualitative criteria to a 2n or choose textbooks to make sure that they are culturally relevant to the students. The first criterion is that the learning materials are unbiased and non-stereotypical. Secondly they should have a

comprehensive, complete, and inclusive view of society and its history. They should also have diverse viewpoints. They should not only represent the culture of the majority group. Good learning materials should build on and extend students' experiences. And finally, they should help students analyze and comprehend how real-life situations.

To analyze the visual images from the specified e-textbooks a qualitative approach was employed. First, the frequencies of all categorized visual images were counted. The images were categorized using the four cultural aspects namely, religion, ethnicity, gender, and socioeconomic status. Secondly, descriptions of all visual images were made. Finally, interpretations of all visual images were developed based on critical pedagogy theory.

Human Images Representing Religions

Only Islam and Catholicism were represented in some of the e-textbooks examined. Six e-textbooks contained human images whose dresses symbolized the Muslim religion. One e-textbook had human images that represented Catholicism.

Table 1 summarized the frequency of human images that represented the six official religions in Indonesia. There were twenty-one images of people who represented Muslims in e-textbook one for grade ten. All of them were women and were categorized into the Muslim category because they were wearing the hijab. Muslim men were not represented in e-textbook one. E-textbooks two, three, four, and seven also depicted Muslim women. They were identified as Muslim because of the dresses they wore. There was only one Muslim man depicted in the English e-textbooks studied. The image of a Muslim man was found in e-textbook four. He was categorized into the Muslim group because he was depicted as wearing a white Muslim cap.

The only human image that represented Catholicism was found in e-textbook eight. A woman was depicted among the crowd of people in a rally opposing abortion. She was classified as representing Catholicism because she was holding a rosary. Other people in the crowd were not classified as representing Catholicism because there were no symbols on them that related them directly as being Catholics. Table 1 showed that the number of human images representing religions was relatively small, only fifty images, compared to 1782 human images in all e-textbooks examined.

Table 1. Human Images that Represent Religion.

| | E-textbook | | | | | | | | |
|----|------------|-------|-------|-------|------|-------|-------|-------|-------|
| | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | TOTAL |
| Mu | 21 | 5 | 1 | 6 | 0 | 7 | 9 | 0 | 49 |
| | 6.9% | 2.4% | 0.6% | 1.7% | | 3.2% | 2.7% | | 2.7% |
| Ρ | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| C | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 |
| | | | | | | | | 0.84% | 0.05% |
| Н | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| В | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Cf | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Un | 282 | 205 | 161 | 340 | 87 | 210 | 329 | 118 | 1732 |
| | 93.1% | 97.6% | 99.4% | 98.3% | 100% | 96.7% | 97.3% | 99.2% | 97.2% |
| | 1782 | | | | | | | | |

Mu: Muslim
P: Protestantism
C: Catholicism
H: Hinduism

Cf: Confucianism U: Undetermined B: Buddhism

Animal and Object Images Representing Religions

There were no animal images in the English e-textbooks examined that represented or symbolized the six official religions in Indonesia. However, it was interesting to note the presence of dogs and pigs, which are often considered to be animals to avoid due to religious reasons in Islam. Camels were found in e-textbook five for grade eleven. They were originally from the Middle East and are often associated with Saudi Arabia where Islam was founded. However, they 42 not related to Islam as a religion.

Table 2 showed that the English e-textbooks fo 4 high school in Indonesia represented four religions Protestantism, Catholicism, Hinduism, and Buddhism by images of objects in their illustrations. Eight images of objects represented both Protestantism and Catholicism. I classified them as to belong to both religions because they were found in both religions. They were images of burial coffins and Easter eggs. I found two images of coffins in e-textbook one for grade ten. I categorized them as representing Protestantism and Catholicism because only Christians use coffins for purposes of burial. Muslims are wrapped with white cloths when they are buried. Buddhists and Hindus are normally cremated in Indonesia. I found three images of painted eggs for Easter in e-textbook three for grade eleven. I considered them to represent both Protestantism and Catholicism because they were found in the traditions of these religions. E-textbook four for eleven graders also had three images of Easter eggs.

The writer used one image of a goddess statue as an illustration in e-textbook one. I considered it as representing Hinduism because such images were often found in Hindu temples in Indonesia. E-textbook two for tenth graders represented Buddhism by showing one image in its illustration. It depicted Borobudur, the largest Buddhist temple in the world. It represented Buddhism, although it was used as an example of a tourist destination in the e-textbook, the temple was still used as a place of worship by Buddhists.

Table 2 showed that most objects were put into undetermined category due to the fact that they did not depict any features that symbolized the six official religions acknowledged by Indonesian government.

Table 2. Object Images that Represent Religion

| | E-textb | ook | | | | | | | |
|----|---------|-------|-------|-------|------|------|------|------|-------|
| | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | Total |
| Mu | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Р | 2 | 0 | 3 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 8 |
| | 3.8% | | 4.3% | 3.3% | | | | | 1.6% |
| C | 2 | 0 | 3 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 8 |
| | 3.8% | | 4.3% | 3.3% | | | | | 1.6% |
| Н | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| | 1.9% | | | | | | | | 0.2% |
| В | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| | | 2.2% | | | | | | | 0.2% |
| Cf | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Un | 50 | 45 | 66 | 89 | 32 | 97 | 77 | 43 | 499 |
| | 94.3% | 97.8% | 95.6% | 96.7% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 98% |
| | 509 | | | | | | | | |

Mu: Muslim P: Protestantism C: Catholicism H: Hinduism B: Buddhism Cf: Confucianism Un: Undetermined

Religious Diversity in Indonesian E-textbooks

Indonesia officially acknowledged six religions in its constitution. Religious diversity was a common phenomenon in everyday lives and at schools. There were public school holidays for each religion in the national curriculum calendar. Including religious topics in learning materials was viewed as showing reality of everyday lives and making the materials contextual.

The English e-textbooks examined included topics related to some religions. The visual images used as illustrations also depicted people and objects representing certain religions. Some visual images were used to provide illustration for texts related to topics about certain religions. Some other images were used as illustrations for texts, which were not about religions. However, not all six religions acknowledged by Indonesian government were represented.

Throughout the eight English e-textbooks examined only Islam and Christianity were represented by human images. There was no animal image that represented religions. Images of objects found in the English e-textbooks series only represented Christianity, Hinduism, and Buddhism. Confucianism was not represented by either human or object images.

Most images that represented religions were not used to illustrate texts about religions. They were used to illustrate texts on unrelated topics. The image of Borobudur temple in e-textbook one, which represented Buddhism for example, was used to provide illustration for a text on tourism. The statue of a Hindu goddess from the same e-textbook was used as an illustration of a text about legend and folk tales. Another example of an image representing religion used as an illustration for non-religious text was the image of a woman holding a rosary. It was used as an illustration of a text about an anti-abortion protest. The images of women wearing hijab, which represented Islam, were also used as illustrations of common activities such as cooking, career, and sports. The only images used as illustrations of texts related to religions were the Easter eggs. They accompanied texts about Easter traditions.

Including visual images related to religion would be ideal to show the reality of religious life in Indonesia. Integrating topics about religions in the learning materials other than learning materials for religious education promoted inter religious understanding among Indonesian students (Haryatmoko, 2010; Kelabora, 1979; Parker, 2010). However, balanced representations and accurate depictions of all religions should be made to develop inclusive learning materials that in turn would promote students' learning motivation. Imbalanced representations and in accurate depictions of any religion would disfranchise certain group of students and demotivate them. Religion is an important cultural aspect in Indonesia, discounting it from instructional materials could have detrimental effect on students (Ladson-Billing, 2009a).

Previous studies showed that religious education failed in promoting inter religion understanding among students because of its segregate nature (Haryatmoko, 2010; Kelabora, 1979; Parker, 2010; Putranta, 2005; Soedjatmoko, 2009). Creating balanced and accurate religion representation through the use of visual images may promote mutual understanding among students with different religions. In the long run it could minimize the existing tensions and conflicts between different religious groups which have not been fully resolved in Indonesia (Haryatmoko, 2010).

Concluding Remarks

The English e-textbooks for high school in Indonesia did not reflect the reality of the existing religions in Indonesia. The images of human beings represented Islam and Christianity but left out Hinduism, Buddhism, and Confucianism. Religion is a sensitive issue and played an important role almost in all aspects of live in Indonesian society. It even often causes tensions and conflicts that have not been properly resolved. The

religious education has failed in promoting inter religion understanding because of its segregate nature. Balanced representation and accurate depiction of the reality of religious life in Indonesia in instructional materials other than the instructional material for religious education could p23 tote inter religious understanding and in the long run would reduce the tensions and conflicts between different religious groups.

The results of the study showed that there were imbalanced representations of religion in the English e-textbooks examined. Developing guidelines for cultural representation was sugitoted to improve the quality and inclusiveness of English instructional materials. It is expected that the results of this study inform teachers, textbook writers and publisher.

References

- Beckford, J.A. (2010). Religious diversity and social problems. In T. Hjelm (Ed.), Religion and social problems (pp. 53-66). Hoboken: Routledge.
- Bell, J. & Gower, R. (1998). Writing course materials for the world: A great compromise. In Tomlison, B. (Ed). Material Development in Language Teaching. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- BPS Strategic Data: Statistics Indonesia (2010). Jakarta: BPS-Statistic Indonesia.
- Campbell, D.E. (2010) Choosing democracy: a practical guide to multicultural education. Boston: Allyn & Bacon.
- Davies, S. G. (2010). Gender diversity in Indonesia: sexuality, Islam, and queer selves. Hoboken: Routledge.
- Giroux, H. A. (1989) Schooling as a form of cultural politics: toward a pedagogy of and for difference. In H.A. Giroux & P. McLaren (Eds.), Critical pedagogy, the state, and cultural struggle (pp. 125-151). Albany: State University of New York Press.
- Haryatmoko. (2010). Dominasi penuh muslihat: Akar kekerasan dan diskriminasi (Domination full of conspiracy: The root of violence and discriminations). Jakarta: Penerbit Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Kachru, B.B. (1976). Models of English for the third world: While man's linguistic burden or language pragmatics? TESOL Quarterly, 10(2), pp. 221-239. Retrieved from http://www.jstor.org/stable/3585643.
- Kachru. B.B. (1996). World Englishes: Agony and ecstasy. Journal of Aestatic Education, Vol. 30 (2), pp. 135-155. Retrieved from http://www.jstor.org/stable/3333196.
- Kachru, B.B. (2008). Symposium on intelligibility and cross-cultural communication in world Englishes: Introduction. World Englishes, 27 (3/4), pp. 293-296.
- Kelabora, L. (1979). Assumption underlying religious instruction in Indonesia. Comparative Education Volume 15 No. 3 October 1979. P. 325-339. Retrieved from http://www.jstor.org/stable/3098905?origin=JSTOR-pdf.
- Krippendorff, K. & Bock, M.A. (2009). The content analysis reader. Los Angeles: Sage. Ladson-Billings, G. (2009a). The dreamkeepers: successful teachers of african american children. San Fransisco: Jossey Bass.
- Ladson-Billings, G. (2009b). Race still matters: critical race theory in education. In M.W. Apple, W. Au & L. A. Gandin (Eds.), The Routledge international handbook of critical education (pp.96-122). Hoboken: Routledge.
- Parker, L. (2010). Religious tolerance and inter-faith education in Indonesia. Presented to the 18th Biennial Conference of the Asian Studies Association of Australia in Adelaide, 5-8 July 2010. Retrieved from http://asaa.asn.au/ASAA2010/reviewed_papers/Parker-Lynn.pdf.
- Putranta, C., S.J. (2005). Sumbangan agama dalam proses reformasi di Indonesia: mencari kerangka pemahaman teoretis dalam perspektif kristiani (The

- contributions of religions to the process of Indonesian reforms: In search of theoretical frameworks in Christian perspectives). In A. M. S. Soewandi, B. Widharyanto, B. Bram, & Y.F. S. T. Nugraha (Eds.), Pelangi pendidikan: tinjauan dari berbagai perspektif (Education antology: Multi perspectives study). Yogyakarta: Penerbit Universitas Sanata Dharma.
- Soedjatmoko. (2009). Pengaruh pendidikan agama terhadap kehidupan sosial (The influence of religious education in social life). In, A. H. Triman (Ed.), Menjadi bangsa terdidik menurut Soedjatmoko (Becoming an educated nation according to Soedjatmiko). Jakarta: Penerbit Buku Kompas.
- Suryadinata L., Arifin, E.N., & Ananta, A. (2005). Indonesia's population: ethnicity and religion in a changing political landscape. Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies.
- Tomlinson, B. (1998a). Material development in language teaching. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Tomlinson, B. (1998b). Seeing what they mean: Helping L2 readers to visualise. In Tomlison, B. (Ed.). Material development in language teaching. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Tomlinson, C.M. & Lynch-Brown, C. (2010). Essential of young adult literature. Boston: Pearson.
- Van Wichelen, S. (2010). Religion, politics, and gender in Indonesia: disputing the Muslim body. Hoboken: Routledge.
- Warta, C. (2011). Perkembangan masalah agama di Papua: Sengketa antaragama dan pencegahan konflik (The development of religious problems in Papua: Inter religions conflicts and the preventions). In M. Ramstedt & F.I. Thufail (Eds.) Kegalauan indentitas: agama, etnisitas, dan kewarganegaraan pada masa pasca Orde Baru (Confused identity: Religion, ethnicity, and citizenship in post New Order era). Jakarta: Grasindo.
- World Trade Press (2010). Indonesia society and culture complete report. Petaluma: World Trade Press.
- Zuhdi, M.(2005). Religious education in Indonesian schools. Paper to be presented at Redesigning Pedagogy: Research, Policy and Practice An International Conference held by the Center for Research in Pedagogy and Practice National Institute of Education, Nanyang Technological University, Singapore, May 30 June 1, 2005. Retrieved from http://conference.nie.edu.sg/paper/new%20 converted/ab00167.pdf

Religion Representation in Indonesian e-Textbooks- A Visual Content Analysis

| ORIGINA | ALITY REPORT | |
|---------|--|-------|
| SIMILA | 6% 12% 6% 8% STUDENT P | APERS |
| PRIMAR | Y SOURCES | |
| 1 | eprints.umpo.ac.id Internet Source | 2% |
| 2 | Submitted to Universitas Sebelas Maret Student Paper | 2% |
| 3 | Submitted to Cornell University Student Paper | 1 % |
| 4 | Subhan Zein, Didi Sukyadi, Fuad Abdul Hamied, Nenden Sri Lengkanawati. "English language education in Indonesia: A review of research (2011–2019)", Language Teaching, 2020 Publication | 1% |
| 5 | Mary Ellen Oslick. "Children's Voices: Reactions to a Criminal Justice Issue Picture Book", The Reading Teacher, 2013 | 1 % |
| 6 | ndl.go.jp Internet Source | 1 % |
| 7 | Submitted to iGroup Student Paper | 1 % |

| 8 | Internet Source | 1 % |
|----|--|-----|
| 9 | Submitted to Daytona Beach Community College Student Paper | 1 % |
| 10 | es.scribd.com Internet Source | 1 % |
| 11 | pingpdf.com Internet Source | 1 % |
| 12 | www.governmentattic.org Internet Source | <1% |
| 13 | ebooks.lpude.in Internet Source | <1% |
| 14 | e-journal.usd.ac.id Internet Source | <1% |
| 15 | Jemma Purdey. "Anti-Chinese Violence in Indonesia, 1996-1999", Brill, 2006 Publication | <1% |
| 16 | Mun'im Sirry, Bagong Suyanto, Rahma Sugihartati, Medhy Aginta Hidayat, Koko Srimulyo. "Fragile civility and the seeds of conflict among youth in contemporary Indonesia", Asian Journal of Comparative Politics, 2022 | <1% |
| 17 | www.eppc.org Internet Source | <1% |

| 18 | aquila.usm.edu Internet Source | <1% |
|----|--|-----|
| 19 | Submitted to Buffalo State College Student Paper | <1% |
| 20 | ink.library.smu.edu.sg Internet Source | <1% |
| 21 | moam.info Internet Source | <1% |
| 22 | www.marquette.edu Internet Source | <1% |
| 23 | Brigitta Hauser-Schäublin, David D. Harnish. "Between Harmony and Discrimination: Negotiating Religious Identities within Majority-Minority Relationships in Bali and Lombok", Brill, 2014 Publication | <1% |

Exclude quotes On Exclude bibliography On

Exclude matches

< 5 words